

On the paper by M. Valluri and D. Merritt "Orbital Instability and Relaxation in Stellar Systems"

V.G.Gurzadyan

Yerevan Physics Institute and University of Rome

The paper by M.Valluri and D.Merritt is discussing an interesting and difficult topic, and obviously many questions remain open. I hope, my comments will be helpful to understand the reasons of the mentioned "debates".

1. It is not precise to state that "exponential instability of N-body problem was shown by Miller [1], Gurzadyan and Savvidy [2]..". The exponents in [1] and [2] are different quantities and have different content.

Miller [1] in his pioneering numerical work has shown the exponential growth of separation of coordinates and velocities for N-body systems. It was indeed a remarkable work of early period of computer astronomy. Due to the development of chaotic dynamics during these decades, our present understanding of that problem is much deeper.

In [2] we have analytically proved the exponential instability of spherical N-body systems in Riemannian space with metric depending on the interaction potential, and the positivity of KS-entropy determined by the curvature (the curvature was zero in Miller's case). This, according to the theorems of ergodic theory, means the existence of the property of mixing and hence tending to an equilibrium (local). KS-entropy is thus defining the time scale of the tending to equilibrium for large N limit, i.e. the relaxation time; for discussion of the meaning of relaxation time see [3].

Mixing therefore is not just "a useful way of thinking" but a strictly defined property of dynamical systems, with sufficient condition (for typical automorphisms) - the positivity of KS-entropy.

Miller's exponent exists even for $N=2$, i.e. for two-body problem which is integrable, with time scale obviously equal to the crossing/orbital time.

While exponent in [2] at $N=2$ turns to infinity and hence – no mixing, no relaxation. The systems of 32 particles shown to be exponentially unstable by Miller [1], are not unstable via criterion [2]. Indeed, what is the meaning of relaxation time for 24 or 32 particles?

The time scale obtained numerically by Miller, Valluri and Merritt, as well as by other authors, must always be of the order of crossing/dynamical time, as actually they had obtained, with no direct relation with relaxation time scale. Via such numerical experiments hence, for example, nobody

had derived (and cannot derive), for example, the two-body relaxation time scale, though nobody seems to be alarmed by it.

The exponent in [2] describes mixing and hence can be associated with relaxation, the exponent in [1] - no. Thus, not every exponential instability means relaxation (for clear example see [4]). The 'debates' quoted by Valluri and Merrit are therefore due to misunderstanding of this crucial point.

Meanwhile, the relaxation time scale obtained in [2] is supported by:

- (a) observational data on globular clusters (see refs in [5]);
- (b) alternative statistical mechanical methods [6];
- (c) numerical experiments [7].

2. The problem of numerical estimation of Lyapunov numbers for N-body gravitating systems is itself a non-trivial one, even forgetting that they are limiting in time quantities. In [8] a theorem is proved showing the non-equivalence of those Lyapunov numbers and their computer images.

3. The massive central object is known to increase the instability and mixing properties of N-body systems [9].

[1] R.H.Miller, ApJ, 140, 250, 1964.

[2] V.G.Gurzadyan, G.K.Savvidy, Doklady AN SSSR, 277, 69, 1984; AA, 160, 203, 1986.

[3] V.G.Gurzadyan, in: Ergodic Concepts in Stellar Dynamics, (Gurzadyan V.G., Pfenniger D., eds.), Springer-Verlag, 1994.

[4] V.G.Gurzadyan, A.A.Kocharyan, AA, 205, 93, 1988.

[5] G.Meylan (this volume); astro-ph/9912495.

[6] M.Antoni, S.Ruffo, A.Torcini (this volume); cond-mat/9908336.

[7] A.A.El-Zant, AA, 326, 113, 1997.

[8] V.G.Gurzadyan, A.A.Kocharyan, J.Phys.A, 27, 2879, 1994.

[9] V.G.Gurzadyan, A.A.Kocharyan, Doklady AN SSSR, 301, 323, 1988; V.G.Gurzadyan, S.G.Matinian, A.A.Kocharyan, Doklady AN SSSR, 296, 54, 1987; A.A.El-Zant, V.G.Gurzadyan, Physica, D, 122, 241, 1998.